

## **Case Study**

Mr. James, CEO, ABC Inc. has to choose one out of the four short listed candidates to spearhead The Network Print Division. All the four candidates have relevant work experience and management skills.

To make our job convenient, based on the required criteria, we developed a weighted average model with 20 desired skills. Extra weight was given to the skills that were needed the most.

The top two required skills, which were given the maximum importance, are “Experience with Networking Products/ Market Understanding” and “Knowledge of Marketing through VARs”. Altogether, these two skills weighted 30% of the entire model.

The other two important skills with 8% weightage each are “Personal Chemistry and Alignment with the Boss” and “Reliability”. Experience at Competitor A was highlighted as another important skill in the case and we weighted that skill at 7%.

The next two skills were focused on expansion and growth, as Mr. James wants to hire someone with the energy and drive to build a sales force and execute on a marketing and communications plan to position the new product. Overall, these growth specific skills were weighted 10% in the selection model.

Experience at Competitor B, C, D, E and F was another skill that had average weightage of 4%.

Few other skills that were considered in the model, but were given a lower weightage are:

- Alignment of Personal Goals with the job
- Business Management
- Comments from References
- Customer Orientation
- Education/ Academic Experience
- Internal Relationship Building - Social Personality
- Match with Company Culture
- Personal Life Balance
- Technical Skills - Understanding of Development Process
- Diversified Job Experience
- Intellectual Curiosity
- Right Attitude: Right brain in the right job

**The candidate selection criteria included in this report has specific comments for each candidate for each of these 20 skills.**

# Candidate Selection Criteria

S. No.	Skill	Max Score and Skill Weight (%)	Christopher Bowan (Experience - 30 Years)	Score	William Pendell (Experience - 9 Years)	Score	Fred Ballon (Experience - 9 Years)	Score	Mitchell Maddison (Experience - 28 Years)	Score
1	Experience with Networking Products - Market Understanding	15	Related experience at A, B, C and D	13	2 years relevant experience at D	10	Has worked in IT industry, but does not have relevant experience	3	Has experience in telecom networking and product experience at B	10
2	Knowledge of Marketing through VARs	15	Managed and grew VAR channels at A	15	As an area manager, managed and grew VAR and OEM at D	15	Has no experience in marketing through VAR	0	Has no experience in marketing through VAR	0
3	Personal Chemistry (Alignment with the Boss)	8	Based on the reference, can be a little stubborn	3	Will respect seniority, his focus is growth	6	Might not align due to lack of relevant work experience	4	Might not be a good fit due to his seniority	2
4	Reliability	8	Has changed 5 companies in the last 8.5 years	3	Can be a reliable candidate as long as he is kept focused	7	Seems not too reliable as he is willing to quit his new job after 6 months	2	Has served both the companies for over 10 years	8
5	Experience at Competitor A	7	Has relevant work experience at A	7	Has not worked at A	0	Has not worked at A	0	Has not worked at A	0
6	Building an organization (Energy & Drive to build a sales force, marketing, communications and product positioning)	5	Gained this experience at A, but not at a senior level	3	Is going through an aggressive phase in the career and wants to grow	5	Is going through an aggressive phase in the career and wants to grow	5	Excellent experience as VP, Premier Accounts at F	5

# Candidate Selection Criteria

S. No.	Skill	Max Score and Skill Weight (%)	Christopher Bowan (Experience - 30 Years)	Score	William Pendell (Experience - 9 Years)	Score	Fred Ballon (Experience - 9 Years)	Score	Mitchell Maddison (Experience - 28 Years)	Score
7	Experience in expanding operations (Growth)	5	Demonstrated experience in 30 years	4	Demonstrated both company and personal growth experience	5	Demonstrated both company and personal growth experience	5	Demonstrated both company and personal growth experience	5
8	Experience at Competitor B, C, D, E and F	4	Spent 8 years at B in his early career	4	Spent 2 years at D	4	Has not worked at D, C, E, F and Z	0	Spent 17 years at C in Marketing/Sales roles	4
9	Alignment of Personal Goals with the job	3	Struggled to get promoted to a senior role after 30 years of experience	1	Wants to grow aggressively, has 9 years of experience	3	Has been in the current profile for only 4 months and is already looking for a change	0	Already in a senior position with a high salary	0
10	Business Management	3	15+ years of experience in sales and product management	2	Excellent academic and work experience	3	Good mix of intermediate and senior experience	3	Excellent marketing and business development experience	3
11	Comments from References	3	Comment from previous boss suggests that he can be stubborn at times	1	Positive comment on Personal Growth	2	As per the new mandate "Political" leaders are not allowed	0	Is focused on a big package	0
12	Customer Orientation	3	Been in "Managerial" sales positions for 30 years	3	Has had senior roles in short career	3	Has had entire career in sales and customer focused roles	3	Been in Senior sales and customer focused profiles	3

# Candidate Selection Criteria

S. No.	Skill	Max Score and Skill Weight (%)	Christopher Bowan (Experience - 30 Years)	Score	William Pendell (Experience - 9 Years)	Score	Fred Ballon (Experience - 9 Years)	Score	Mitchell Maddison (Experience - 28 Years)	Score
13	Education/ Academic Experience	3	BA from Ohio State University - 1963	1	BA and MBA - 1983	3	B.Sc. Marketing - 1982	2	Marketing Diploma from Babson College - 1964	1
14	Internal Relationship Building - Social Personality (Take advantage of the existing organization)	3	Spent several years in relationship focused roles	3	Has managed teams and has excellent relationship building skills	3	Might not be very well liked due to the short tenure with previous organization	1	Is a senior leader and can win the internal respect easily	3
15	Match with Company Culture	3	Before A, has worked at G and few other smaller companies	2	Has a flexible personality	3	Has worked at smaller companies	3	Has not worked at smaller companies	1
16	Personal Life Balance	3	Not enough information is available	1	Not enough information is available	1	Family oriented with social personality	3	Not enough information is available	1
17	Technical Skills - Understanding of Development Process	3	Has seen the process at A	3	Is a fast learner and has gained the experience at C	2	Been in related technical roles in early career	3	Is not very technical	1
18	Diversified Job Experience	2	Diversified experience with 8 companies over 30 years	2	9 years of experience at 2 companies	1	9 years of experience at 5 companies	2	Only worked at 2 companies in 28 years	1
19	Intellectual Curiosity	2	Developed strategic approach	1	Has worked in corporate planning	2	Is technically inclined	2	Can be in the mindset "I know it all"	1
20	Right Attitude: Right brain in the right job	2	Has relevant growth oriented experience	1	Is going through a "Hungry" stage in his career	2	In his mid-career and has the right attitude	2	Has relevant marketing skills for the job	2
<b>Total</b>		<b>100</b>		<b>73</b>	<b>Top Score</b>	<b>80</b>		<b>43</b>		<b>51</b>

Our model indicates that William Pendell is the top candidate for the job with an overall score of 80%. William has grown rapidly in his career and has brilliant experience in marketing through VARs. He has also gained the market understanding. Since he has only gained 9 years of experience, he will definitely respect seniority and is completely focused on his personal growth. He will be willing to take advantage of the bonus program and grow the business. He is definitely someone who has the drive and the energy. He is also the only candidate who has an MBA degree. He led a team of 10 national account executives covering Fortune 200 companies. He definitely lacks diversified experience, as he has only worked with 2 companies in the last 9 years. Since, he is in the middle management, his focus would be an excellent salary package and not a Vice President title. We can offer him the title, Director or Senior Director, VAR Strategic Planning and Business Development and make him report to the VP, OEM Strategic Planning and Business Development, whose new title will become VP, OEM & VAR Strategic Planning and Business Development. Key question for William Pendell is: What can we do to ensure that he spends a long tenure, like he did with Competitor C, with us? Looking at William's motivation to grow we should give him a raise of 15%-20% on his existing package and give him a 10% performance based bonus on the base salary.

Another, candidate who scored 73% and is not too far behind of William Pendell is Christopher Bowan. After gaining 30 years of experience, Christopher has the best market understanding amongst all the candidates. Christopher worked with Competitor C and D for over 14 years early in his career, although in his recent career he has changed over 5 companies in the last 8.5 years. He is currently working in the desired profile at Competitor A and has the experience, but his former boss described him as "sometimes abrasive, headstrong and stubborn", this comment brought his score down in the "Personal Chemistry" skill, with 10% rating. Throughout his career, he has been in managerial positions and not been selected to senior level position, this shows lack of recognition for his leadership skills or lack of personal alignment. Based on the analysis, the key question for Christopher Bowan is: Does he believe that he needs to invest in specific senior management and leadership courses to prepare him for this senior position? Also, same as William, we can offer him the title, Director or Senior Director, VAR Strategic Planning and Business Development and make him report to the VP, OEM Strategic Planning and Business Development, whose new title will become VP, OEM & VAR Strategic Planning and Business Development. Chris' experience and relationships at Competitor A are key, we should give him a raise of 25% along with his new "Director" title, if he negotiates, we can add some bonus structure to the package as well.

Fred Ballon and Mitchell Maddison, with 9 and 28 years of experience respectively have excellent sales and marketing experience, but they both lack the knowledge of marketing through VARs and also do not score really well on the market understanding. Also, they might not be a good fit with the boss as Fred does not have relevant experience and Mitchell is too senior and does not fit in the personal chemistry criteria. Also, both of them have not gained any experience at Competitor A. Fred's reference suggests that he is good at playing politics, while Mitchell is extremely focused on the "Big" package. Fred scored 43 and Mitchell scored 51 out of 100 in our model and at this time both these candidates should not be called for the interview.